



Junior Reserved Officers Training Corps (JROTC) Expansion at Highland Park High School

JROTC is a desired program by students and their families, and is currently offered at: Como Park (Marines), Harding (Navy), Humboldt (Army), Johnson (Air Force) and Washington (Navy). The program teaches leadership, strong academic content, and service to the country and community. The program attracts and benefits most demographic groups: gender, ethnicity, socioeconomic status and disability. SPPS has an accomplished 21-year history and is recognized by the regional supervisors as having exemplary programs.

Budget

Fully Financed budget, except for stipend. For fiscal year 2017, SPPS cost is estimated at \$567,500 and Department of Defense cost is estimated at \$432,500. Units typically have one retired officer and one senior enlisted. Approximate program cost \$200k; with approximately half covered by the Department of Defense. Air Force provides operations funding includes:

- All uniforms and curriculum materials
- Field trip meals and transportation
- Classroom and office supplies including IT equipment
- Half of Minimum Instructor Pay based on military rank upon retirement

Curriculum

- 60% of curriculum are subjects that include the history of aviation and aviation's impact on society; meteorology, navigation, propulsion, principles of flight, aerospace industry and the career opportunities it provides
- Other 40% includes a mix of aerospace science topics, leadership and wellness topics
- Curriculum is reviewed annually, complete re-write every five years for currency
- Typically 2 days per week AS, 2 days LE and 1 day wellness
- The JROTC program is separate from the IB program
- The JROTC elective class would not be during the same period everyday
- JROTC elective classes may/may not conflict with other classes



- The scheduling of the classes will be decided upon by the school administrators
- JROTC classes count towards only elective courses
- JROTC programs across all units (Army, Marines, Navy, Air Force) offer similar classes to one another

AFJROTC Mission, Goals, Objectives

Develop citizens of character dedicated to serving their nation and community

Goal

- To instill the values of citizenship, service to the United States, personal responsibility, and a sense of accomplishment

Objectives

- To educate and train students in citizenship and life skills
- To promote community service
- To instill a sense of responsibility
- To develop character and self-discipline through education and instruction in air and space fundamentals and the Air Force's core values of "Integrity First, Service Before Self and Excellence In All We Do."
 - Not an explicit military recruiting program, no military obligation
 - Provides enlistment benefit if cadets decide to join military
- 2/3 years in JROTC entitles cadets to college benefits

Facility Requirements

- Secure room separate from classroom
- Climate controlled, minimum 400' sq storage + cadet uniform fitting area
- May not be used jointly, access limited to AFJROTC personnel only

Implications – Benefits*

- Strong emphasis on citizenship
- Involvement in community service at school and in the community
- Cadets explore a number of careers, especially those connected with science
- Students are expected to maintain high standards in academics, behavior, and attendance
- A positive leadership opportunity for the older students
- An additional elective for students to choose from
- Post high school opportunities available

* Note: Whether the implication is a benefit or a concern, it is based on individual perspectives.



- Civic leadership opportunities available
- A strong option for a wide array of students
- Desired by many SPPS students and parents at current schools offering JROTC
- Ties into the five pillars of college and career readiness
- The mission of the IB program does not conflict with the mission of JROTC; though regarded as a pro-international program, IB is flexible enough so that all schools in all countries can honor their national pride.
- Students are able to choose how much they want to participate in the JROTC before- and after-school programs
- Adding a JROTC program to a school does not require other classes to be cut
- JROTC courses will count towards a student's overall GPA
- JROTC class sizes are set by school administrators

Implications – Drawbacks/Concerns*

- Budget shortfall may not allow for funding for SPPS commitment
- Parents and community groups' perspectives differ with some supporting the opportunity while others not supporting having a military presence in high schools
- Impact on our Graduates that enlist in the military include successful career, psychological and, financial impacts if enlisted during a time of war
- Negative impact for students that have experienced war and view the military as harmful
- Implicitly recruits high school students for military
- Military recruitment targets students of color
- May hinder gaining the IB diploma if participate in the JROTC program as students' schedules only allows so many classes; students may have to decide IB diploma vs. JROTC program – can't do all
- To mitigate the concern that students will PTSD may be triggered by cadets in uniform, SPPS has worked for many years to build Trauma Sensitive Schools which use best practices as a universal precaution to avoid triggering students with PTSD.

Vetting process steps for expanding JROTC

- Former Superintendent Valeria Silva and current **Superintendent John Their gave support for vetting**
- **Application process, and key components to sustain a successful unit** were provided by current staff where program is offered
- **Researched Coast Guard:** Under Department of Homeland Security

* Note: Whether the implication is a benefit or a concern, it is based on individual perspectives.



- Responsible for sea-going services including lakes. This includes search and rescues missions, maritime law enforcement and port security, supervising light houses. Two JROTC programs, one in Miami, Fl. And the other in Elizabeth City, NC.
- **Researched Air Force**
 - Congressional approval has been received to expand units in Minnesota. Regional commander supports our application.
- **Garnered support from school principals:** Mary Mackbee (Central) and Winston Tucker (HPS)
- **Gathered feedback from:** formal parent groups at Central and Highland Park and leadership team and staff at Highland Park.
 - **Highland's PTSA supported reviewing JROTC has an option**
 - Central parent group did not support.
 - School leadership team and formal parent groups were given information by principals and Assistant Superintendent. JROTC instructors, teachers and parents were invited to share information about the program.
 - Staff meeting presentation: same format as above, but allowed staff to answer questions, give feedback and give consensus to move forward.
- **Consulted with Denise Quinlan, former assistant superintendent and William Dunn former principal of Arlington High School** the last unit to be approved in SPPS.
- National coordinator for Coast Guard did not respond to several inquiries from Assistant Superintendent. **Principal and Highland PTSA expressed desire to explore other possibilities than the Coast Guard.**
- **Consulted with Coleman McDonough, principal of North Branch High school, the last Air Force unit approved in Minnesota**
- **Determined facilities needs for FMP.** Facilities Dept. has conducted a space utilization process at Highland. Additional classroom spaces were included in Highland's FMP and some of the spaces will be designated for JROTC.
- **Gather student and parent feedback** with special outreach to:
 - Current 7th-10th grade students at Highland Park Middle School, Highland Park High School and any other feeder programs to HPS
 - Student focus groups
 - Specific communication and opportunities for feedback from families of color and a second community meeting.
- **Community meeting held on October 27, 6:00-7:30 p.m.** Parent and students, neighbors and community organizations involved invited. On October 27, 2016 a Highland Park Community meeting was held to share information, gather comments and answer questions regarding adding an Air Force JROTC. There were approximately 35 people in attendance. Participants included current HPS students, former graduate, current parents of middle and high school students, and veterans. **(See attached comments/questions.)**



- **Community meeting held on December 5, 6:00-8:30 p.m.** There were approximately 45 people in attendance at this community meeting. Participants included current HPHS students, former graduates, current parents of middle and high school students, community members, concerned citizens and veterans. *(See attached comments/questions.)*

Next Steps

- **Post information sheet** on HPMS and HPHS websites
- **Share information from vetting process to Superintendent John Thein** for final recommendation to the Board of Education.
 - If support is given, submit formal application to the Air Force (Department of Defense) for a JROTC unit at Highland Park High School. Congress must give final approval if the application is approved.
- **If approved**, the program will start at Highland Park High School at the start of the 2018-19 school year.



Appendix I – Senior Participation Graph

Senior Survey data about postsecondary plans

(2016 all senior report about plans and 2016 seniors enrolled in JROTC)

Site	Attend 4 year college	Attend 2 year college	Total 2 & 4 year college	Attend college outside	Complete apprenticeship program	Un-determined	Join the Military	Other	Work full-time
AGAPE	61%	15%	76%	0%	2%	5%	0%	2%	15%
Central	14%	74%	89%	1%	0%	3%	1%	4%	2%
Como Park	36%	47%	83%	1%	1%	3%	3%	7%	3%
Creative Arts	21%	39%	61%	0%	0%	9%	0%	12%	18%
Gateway	42%	42%	83%	0%	0%	8%	0%	8%	0%
Gordon Parks	52%	11%	64%	0%	2%	11%	0%	0%	23%
Harding	33%	38%	71%	0%	0%	9%	2%	9%	9%
Highland Park	19%	68%	87%	2%	0%	3%	2%	3%	4%
Humboldt	33%	38%	71%	0%	0%	9%	2%	9%	9%
Johnson	35%	50%	85%	1%	0%	4%	4%	3%	4%
LEAP	51%	5%	56%	0%	0%	5%	0%	5%	35%
OWL	46%	32%	79%	0%	0%	4%	11%	7%	0%
Washington	38%	49%	87%	0%	0%	3%	4%	2%	4%
TOTAL	30%	53%	83%	1%	1%	4%	2%	4%	5%

Site	Branch	Total # of Senior Cadets	4 year Degree	2 year Program	Military Enlistment (incl. National Guard)	Un-determined	Career/ Certificates
Washington	Navy	29	13	5	7	0	4
Harding	Navy	23	7	9	6	0	1
Humboldt	Army	38	24	6	6	0	2
Como	Marines	9	3	3	1	0	2
Johnson	Air Force	15	4	5	3	1	2
TOTAL		114	51	28	23	1	11



Appendix II – JROTC Participation by Race Chart

Number of Cadets Per Unit by Race - SY2016-17 (1st Quarter)												
	Como Park Senior High		Harding Senior High		Humboldt Secondary School		Johnson Senior High		Washington Tech			
	Number of Students in Marines JROTC Unit	Total Student Pop.	Number of Students in Navy JROTC Unit	Total Student Pop.	Number of Students in Army JROTC Unit	Total Student Pop.	Number of Students in Air Force JROTC Unit	Total Student Pop.	Number of Students in Navy JROTC Program	Total Student Pop.	Total number of Students in JROTC Programs	Total Student Pop across Unit Schools
American Indian	0	12	0	42	1	16	2	25	3	22	6	117
Asian	54	384	96	1062	92	521	45	719	95	1210	382	3896
Hispanic	10	88	25	211	24	233	36	139	20	248	115	919
Black	23	612	25	444	31	411	21	321	9	542	109	2330
White	22	669	14	126	6	62	22	136	8	92	72	1085
Multiracial	1	0	0	0	0	0	4	0	0	0	5	0
Total	110	1765	160	1885	154	1243	130	1340	135	2114	689	8347



Appendix III – Student Focus Group Summaries

The purpose of conducting focus groups is to gauge students' perspectives and interest in the JROTC program. Principal Tucker recruited 2-3 students from each student group and athletic teams to participate in the focus groups; about thirty students participated in the focus groups overall. A few days prior to the focus group sessions, a meeting with all student participants was conducted in which they learned about the Air Force JROTC curriculum and were given an opportunity to pose questions.

Focus Group #1 – Summary from transcriptions

Dec 1, 2016

1. Questions
 - a. What kind of commitment do you need to be part of the program?
 - b. Is it integrated with the IB system or is it separate from the IB system?
 - c. Would you take a JROTC elective during the same period everyday?
 - d. Will it conflict with other classes that are provided?
 - e. How would the scheduling of the classes be figured out?
 - f. Would the aerospace science class count towards an elective credit or could it count towards a science credit?
 - g. Do we really need this program? We already have fitness classes and opportunities to be leaders and diverse groups of programs (i.e. clubs).
 - h. Where will that money come from? We are cutting programs, how are we supposed to be able to add another one? You have to rebuild in my mind what you lost before you can start adding more things.
2. Which elective courses are you scared of having to give up if you decide to take an AFJROTC elective course?
 - a. Five out of eight students in the focus group said they would take a course
 - b. TA-ing for special education and gym
 - c. Strength and fitness class
 - d. Failing to get the IB diploma – many courses are required to gain the IB diploma. There isn't room to give up any electives to participating in the JROTC program.
3. Concerns with having the JROTC program at Highland:
 - a. It would not be an advantageous thing to enroll in it if you're hoping to achieve an IB diploma.
 - b. Scheduling
 - c. Do we have enough physical space?
 - d. Students from Central may want to transfer to Highland; therefore, more space would be needed
 - e. That it has a presence before school, during school and after school – what does that mean, space-wise, for other clubs that meet before and after school? Will those clubs be booted out?
 - f. I kind of wonder how adding another program will affect kids where if it's set on a track determined by the district and then cut out of that track. And, then another concern I have is so for field trips they can be very, they're like a great experience but they're very disruptive to the rest of your academic schedule.



4. Benefits of having JROTC program at Highland:
 - a. Would give more leadership opportunities
 - b. The mission of JROTC (national pride) conflicts with the mission of the IB program (internationalism)
 - c. Giving an opportunity to do community service to those who may not currently have an opportunity to do community service
5. What does the Mission Statement mean to you?
 - a. What's their definition of 'character'?
 - b. Being able to volunteer in community service makes you feel really good about yourself

Focus Group #2 – Summary from transcription

Dec 1, 2016

1. Questions
 - a. If you're in Air Force JROTC, would it be hard to switch to another branch of the military if you wanted to go that route?
 - b. Are the classes in Air Force JROTC similar to other classes in the other JROTC programs?
 - c. If you sign up for JROTC, are you automatically signed up for the classes [is it all or nothing? Do you have a choice in which electives to take?]
 - d. If you are in the IB program, would our schedule allow to take JROTC classes?
 - e. If the program doesn't get up and running until mid-year of next year, as a senior can you participate in any of the classes [during the last half of the year]?
 - f. Will these electives count towards the required courses credits (would an aerospace science elective course count towards the required science credits)?
 - g. As an athlete who has practice after school, would it hinder me/be frowned upon, if I choose to go to practice over participating in the community service aspect of JROTC?
2. Which elective courses are you scared of having to give up if you decide to take an AFJROTC elective course?
 - a. Don't have room in schedule to give up any courses to take an AFJROTC course
 - b. I would give up TA-ing
 - c. Students tend to fill their elective schedules with the classes that are deemed as an "easy A."
 - d. The program would allow students to have other opportunities rather than having to only choose from artsy or sporty electives.
3. Concerns with having the JROTC program at Highland:
 - a. The shift between being part of JROTC in high school to being part of ROTC in college – once in college, hard to get out of ROTC. JROTC may give the wrong impression of what ROTC in college is like.
 - b. How do you participate in the after school program part of JROTC when you are already committed to other clubs and sports?
 - c. Physical space – where would we put the program?
 - d. Will other classes be cut because we decided to bring this program here?
4. Benefits of having JROTC program at Highland:
 - a. Gives more choices of electives
 - b. Learning something that you never thought you could
 - c. Leadership component of the program



- d. Anybody can join
 - e. It would be good at filling the gap we have – those who aren't interested in art or music can find something they're interested in with this program
 - f. Attract diverse groups of people – being part of this program isn't dependent on athleticism or special skills (like Chess Club only gets people who can play Chess well)
5. What does the Mission Statement mean to you?
- a. Becoming leaders in our workplace or in just general areas
 - b. Being a leader in society and being able to take charge of a situation
 - c. The program can help you become a better person in life
 - d. Becoming a better person to others and helping them out rather than helping yourself out so much
 - e. Helping people develop the skills to lead by example and be a part of a community and do what's right in the community
6. Additional questions....
- a. Gender equality – how do we make sure that not only guys are signing up for the program?

Focus Group #3 – Summary from transcriptions

Dec 2, 2016

1. Questions
 - a. With the IB program, I'm really limited with the amount of electives I can take. So how does this program work with the courses we are required to take in IB?
 - b. Would this program be underneath a credit like art or science or tech?
 - c. Where would the funding come from?
2. Which elective courses are you scared of having to give up if you decide to take an AFJROTC elective course?
 - a. Band
 - b. IB courses
 - c. Art credits
3. Concerns with having the JROTC program at Highland:
 - a. This program will take away funding from other programs
 - b. Some gets may get picked on for wearing the uniforms
 - c. I'm just worried that it would come and it wouldn't be as popular as we hoped for
4. Benefits of having JROTC program at Highland:
 - a. Look good on college applications
 - b. Great opportunity
 - c. Interesting courses
 - d. Wellness program would appeal to a lot of kids
 - e. Progression of the leadership courses
 - f. Be able to explore options and see if military is something you would want to do in the future – "test the waters"
 - g. Help future career goals
 - h. It would offer a sense of "family" and create strong bonds among program participants
5. How well would this program fit into Highland's community?



- a. I think generally Highland is pretty supportive of like all of its organizations and clubs. And so I think it would fit in in that sense where people, if you're interested in it, that's good for you. And if you're not, you'll be left alone.
 - b. Highland students are really interested in leadership stuff
 - c. It would help students be motivated and have a good work ethic for those who don't already have those characteristics
 - d. Its not economically limiting for people to be involved.
 - e. The anti-military sentiment is coming from the parents, not the students.
6. What does the Mission Statement mean to you?
- a. It means that they just want to like make good people and make sure we're prepared to like live our lives developed
 - b. Learn how to serve your community
 - c. Make good local citizens who are informed, educated and aren't ignorant
 - d. They want to make good people

Focus Group #4 – Summary from transcriptions

Dec 2, 2016

1. Questions
 - a. How successful has it been at other schools?
 - b. Would these courses affect your GPA for the year?
 - c. If you're not officially part of the program, can you still take some of the courses?
 - d. How hard can the JROTC instructors be on the cadets – physically and mentally?
 - e. How does each high school decide which branch they want to them to share with the student?
 - f. How many classes would they have per day?
 - g. And would the classes begin with their elective classes or not?
 - h. Are there like, do they teach their students different things from other branches? Or like the same things?
 - i. How good does it look on a resume? Will it benefit you to get into college?
 - j. Is there like a limit to how many students can join each class?
 - k. What is the investment then of the Air Force wanting in funding this if they're not trying to enlist people?
 - l. How strict is the wellness program that they have?
2. Which elective courses are you scared of having to give up if you decide to take an AFJROTC elective course?
 - a. Two out of four students in this focus group said they would take a course
 - b. Journalism
 - c. Yearbook
 - d. May not be able to sign up for art classes because there's no more room in your schedule to do so
3. Concerns with having the JROTC program at Highland:
 - a. It seems like some of the leadership courses are covered in other classes already
 - b. There are courses that may attract people to sign up but won't because they don't want to be affiliated with JROTC [military].



- c. One concern is that some people don't like the military; therefore, won't like JROTC.
 - d. Some people may be concerned with students taking the drills and ceremonies courses
 - e. What I think in Leadership 100, it talks about teaching ethics and morals, and I think people might be against having the military teach ethics and morals, because they don't think it's a moral or ethical organization.
4. Benefits of having JROTC program at Highland:
 - a. You will know how to talk. They taught me how to show respect.
 - b. More options for more people are always a good thing.
 - c. I like how it's not mandatory
 5. How well would this program fit into Highland's community?
 - a. It might create another community for other people to join, so then they feel like they have a community within the school
 - b. This program make leaders in a different way, more to like be more disciplined and more respectful towards everything else. So, it does have that aspect of leadership, by having it a different way that like lead crew does, or yearbook does, or journalism.
 - c. One thing that might be a bit of a disconnect is Highland is an IB school, which is an International Bachelor and having a very American based program in international school, might send odd messages to like the IB program and it would be really bad if Highland became a not IB school because there's a military organization that joined it.
 - d. I like it wouldn't just be different for the student. I feel like it would be different for everybody in the whole school. Since we've never like seen Highland as students or teachers who wear like their whole military outfits to school....and having like a military like Air Force program here, is just going to be different, not sort of what we're used to as an entire school.
 6. What does the Mission Statement mean to you?
 - a. Serving the nation part would be actually joining the military, but then for the community part, kind of be like standing up for people when they can't. Developing character is building up their own self, another part of themselves.
 - b. I feel like dedicating your life to your nation. That's how like I see it. Not necessarily like just an elective.
 - c. The rest of this it just sounds like a thing people do. And then the mission statement feels like a life calling.



Appendix IV – Questions and Feedback from Oct 27, 2016 Community Meeting

JROTC Meeting Comments/Questions October 27, 2016

What does JROTC cost the district?

Fiscal Year 2017 estimated costs are District cost \$567,500 and Department of Defense cost is estimated at \$432,500 for the current 5 units

What percent of JROTC does not go into the military?

For the class of 2015 out of 116 seniors, 52 planned on attending a 4 year college or university, 23 a 2 year college, 3 planned on pursuing a career and/or advanced certification and 12 were undecided based on self reporting. Class of 2016 data is being submitted by the schools.

What percent JROTC go career vs 4 year enlistment?

SPPS does not have this information.

What exposure do JROTC have to recruiters?

Just like all high school students public data for JROTC cadets is available to recruiters. There is no in classroom recruitment. In Saint Paul Public Schools, the following information about students is public:

- Name
- Birth Date
- Grade
- School
- Dates of Enrollment
- Awards Received
- Extra-Curricular Information (including height and weight of athletes)

Both the Minnesota Legislature and the United States Congress have passed laws requiring public schools to also release addresses and telephone numbers of students in high school to military recruiters. You have the option of refusing to release this information regarding yourself/your student. If you do not want Saint Paul Public Schools to release information about yourself/your son or daughter to military recruiters, please fill out the military opt out form and return it to your school. Either the student or the parent may choose not to release information to military recruiters. That choice will remain in effect until the parent submits a written request to the school allowing the release of information to military recruiters.

For more information regarding directory/public information, please visit [Student Records and Your Rights](#).

Enrollment in JROTC reflects the diversity of each schools' population. Their input is given via their election to enroll in the classes and their active participation in the classes.

Why can we afford JROTC but not anything else!

Information about the school district budget that includes school and program budget can be found [here](#).



Appendix V – Questions and Feedback from Dec. 5, 2016 Community Meeting

Community Meeting – Dec. 5, 2016

Re: Air Force JROTC expansion at Highland Park High School

Questions from index cards:

- 1) What are the impacts on the school budget, especially for students not in the program?
- 2) Is JROTC required to accept all students with IEPs and to abide by the accommodations?
- 3) A benefit listed on your survey lists academic support. What does that look like?
- 4) If a student enrolls in JROTC will he be required to pay an activity fee?
- 5) What is the financial and budget tradeoff to this program? Can see curriculum but what are the money risks to SPPS's budget?
- 6) What are the benefits for students to go through JROTC? After the student goes through this training does he/she get a job?
- 7) How would you avoid triggering students with PTSD from their past military experiences when even students in uniform may be heavy triggers?
- 8) Why fund such an expensive "elective" that will take funding away from all others?
- 9) Although JROTC implements community service, that can be achieved through other routes – why not promote alternate community service opportunities?

Comments from index cards:

- 1) This program is highly useful and should be implemented without hesitation. The program prepares and enables the students to gain valuable knowledge that helps them to be active citizens to serve properly to accomplish and realize the desired goals of the community and the country. Finally, I recommend this program has to be implemented as planned and advise all unnecessary voices against this program has to be ignored. Thank you.
- 2) Vetting is supposed to include finding flaws! What has the district and school done to determine what the flaws are? This is offered after school.
- 3) I'm concerned that there is filming of this event without invitation by SPPS. Kinda makes me reluctant to speak up.
- 4) No JROTC in our schools!
- 5) JROTC is a slick insidious marketing strategy built by the military to sustain support and massive funding for war. War is the military's only business.
- 6) Our teachers should be teaching us these skills.; you're taking money away from the electives we already have; there are programs outside of school this is a place of learning; we need this safe school to stay safe; the presentation was all fluff; I am a student of color at Highland Park Middle School and I don't want this program in my future school.
- 7) Promoting a violent organization that has historically oppressed Black and Brown people; we had a veteran at the last meeting even say this is a bad idea
- 8) I have PTSD from years and years of physical and emotional abuse from my father. I can't imagine going to a safe place like school to be tormented by my traumatic experiences. Students who are immigrants have been scarred by traumatic military experiences; students walking in uniform ARE TRIGGERS!



- 9) While many SPPS schools offer this program, Highland has the opportunity to remain the safe place that it is for students with PTSD.

**Community Meeting – Dec 5, 2016
Expansion of JROTC to Highland Park High School
Summary from Individual Feedback Forms**

1. How are you affiliated to Highland Park High School (Please indicate number for each response):
19 Parent 4 Student at Highland Park Middle or High School
4 St. Paul city resident 2 Concerned Citizen
2. In your opinion, what are the top 3 benefits to having JROTC at Highland Park Senior High School? Place tally marks for each individual response.

- Academic support **8**
- Career exploration **4**
- Develops character **9**
- Develops citizenship **4**
- Expands elective course offerings **4**
- Field trips
- Leadership opportunity **13**
- Potential for career in service to community **3**
- Potential for career in the military **2**
- Science, math and technology curriculum **5**
- Service to community **5**
- Service to the country **2**

Please note: There were **10** people who indicated that there were no benefits to the program

Other (please specify) **2** - Access to opportunities previously unavailable; fitness training opportunities



4. In your opinion, what are the drawbacks to having JROTC at Highland Park High School? Place tally marks for each individual response.

- Budget **13**
- Military presence in the school **9**
- Military recruitment **4**
- Not aligned with mission of the school **6**
- Pipeline to military service **5**
- Reduces students curricular options **3**
- Space in the school **3**
- Students may be shunned **2**
- Other (please specify) **5**

Please note: There were **11** people who indicated that there were no drawbacks to the program

Other Feedback:

- 1) My son, now 24, is LT in Army National Guard. He was a straight A honor student and athlete in high school. But he did not have the discipline. If he would have been offered this program in high school, perhaps he would have found success in college. Core values of Army National Guard: Loyalty, integrity, honor, selfless service, duty, personal courage
- 2) I would like to see a 3-4 sentence explanation of benefits and drawbacks listed here before asked to complete the survey on behalf of my 7th and 10th grade children.
- 3) I am very moved by students who would prefer to have a high school available in the district that does not have this program. I also feel the district should provide bussing for kids who want to attend a JROTC program, just like they do for immersion and gifted programs. Perhaps that should include an option for students to leave high schools with JROTC if they find it to be traumatizing.
- 4) I don't see why people are against this; it is an opportunity just as much as PSEO or IB.
- 5) The district has presented a biased proposal of this program – 2 meetings in favor; 0 meetings not in favor; at least there were translators; we need more outreach with parents of color.
- 6) Proper vetting is necessary that includes info from both sides
- 7) Negative impact on students with PTSD; perpetuates dominance over colored students



- 8) Don't do it!
- 9) Don't do it!
- 10) I do not see any drawbacks to the program. The theory that this program is a pipeline to military service is not supported by data. I hope that HPHS decides in favor of the program and that the input of HP parents and students is given more weight than that of outside individuals. For students who are motivated to participate in this program it offers a valuable opportunity. Give that this is an elective and no one is going to be required to participate, I do not understand the opposition's desire to prevent students who want to participate from doing so. Students from immigrant/refugee backgrounds who may fear the military have survived at the other SPPS schools that have JROTC programs. I know personally of some Karen kids who fit this category and have joined JROTC.
- 11) Why would students be shunned for joining an activity they enjoy? I have not witnessed any type of bullying since I have been there. This program offers new directives to students and options especially if they have an interest in the military.
- 12) My son had JROTC at another school and had a fantastic experience. He did not continue it in college. It had a major impact on his development of confidence, responsibility, giving back to community, and leadership. He is a fine young man who owes much to the JROTC program. My daughter is a freshman at Highland. She is brown. My son is white. I was way too thrown by the disrespect to speak.
- 13) Is there any recruitment element at all? I'm a proponent, but just thought I'd ask the question. What is the impact to other Highland High programs if the JROTC is added? Will any programs or electives be cut? This seems to be a concern for the Highland students at the meeting.
- 14) Where is JROTC present outside of SPPS?
- 15) I would like to focus on the merits of the JROTC program itself. Discussing this at a global-level, and discussing the merits of the military take away from the discussion of the program itself. Thanks.
- 16) If the military isn't meant to kill, what is it meant for? Biased meeting with only one side presented.
- 17) I own property as well as live in St. Paul and strongly object to my tax dollars going towards this training program in St Paul Public Schools. I am a 1968 graduate of Highland Park; I am a mother of five sons, all graduates of St. Paul Public Schools. The military targets people of color and often young people without access to opportunity due to racism. As a former volunteer coordinator in the community, I believe there are so many more life-enhancing opportunities for our youth. Military training/partnerships do NOT belong in public schools.
- 18) Military presence (and recruitment) in schools tends to prey on vulnerable and disadvantaged (often P.O.C.S), student who may not have as many options as more privileged students. When my son was in high school at Central, military recruiters had access to all of my son's personal information, including grades, extra-curricular activities, personal cell phone number, etc. He was a minor and was contacted by recruiters on his personal phone. Recruiters also showed up at his sporting events and passed out war game videos, caps cups, etc. As a parent, I felt that I needed to protect him from 'predators' – as he was a typical vulnerable teen. Inviting the



military into a school seems like a huge waste of money – and a great lack of creativity. We/You can do better!!

- 19) Please give Highland the chance to have the JROTC program. Education is about choice and learning. Since JROTC would be another elective or choice and has interest at Highland, it makes sense to offer the program.
- 20) Would JROTC be a zero-sum event or only an addition? What is the success rate to ROTC, then to officer careers? Just want to learn more. There needs to be better ground rules at these meetings – some rude parents here.
- 21) A drawback to the program is validation of military in eyes of students and community. There is no reason to believe the U.S. military has altruist educational goals (whether individual instructors do not). The presence of military in the school is one more piece of the large advertising and strong-arm recruitment the U.S. government and military employs to fuel and support war and imperialism abroad. Voices for peace and justice do not get the same platform and advertng. JROTC cannot be compared to any other elective anymore than we would allow gangs to come provide auto mechanic and pharmacy classes. It is not without context.
- 22) I think this is a great chance for other students to be engaged in a program that gives them great opportunities.



Appendix VI – Research Summaries

1. Kariuki, Patrick and Williams, Linda. “The Relationship between Character Traits and Academic Performance of AFJROTC High School Students.” Milligan College. Spring 2006.
 - a. The sample of this study consisted of twenty randomly selected male cadets and twenty female cadets enrolled in AFJROTC classes at Sullivan South High School. (page 2)
 - b. JROTC Program Effectiveness:
 - i. A total of 344 surveys were mailed to principals of North Carolina high schools and 184 surveys were returned (a 54% response rate). (page 7)
 - ii. The opinion data indicated that the principals agree that the cadets benefited from the JROTC programs, especially in the areas of leadership, citizenship and teamwork. (page 7)
 - iii. The researchers collected data from ten groups of students (27,490 students) from urban high schools. (page 9)
 - iv. The statistical analysis of the data indicated that the JROTC Career Academics were more effective at improving attendance, grades and graduation rates than the general academic program or regular ROTC program. (page 9)
 - c. Opponents of JROTC in high schools
 - i. Lutz and Bartlett (1995) researched JROTC programs for two years and were critical of the programs. (page 10)
 - ii. Nationwide, 54% of the JROTC cadets (excluding the Marines) were minority students. (page 10)
 - iii. The JROTC programs also attract young women; in 1994, 40% of the cadets were female. (page 10)
 - iv. Even though the JROTC explicitly states that the purpose of JROTC is not to recruit, 45% of cadets enlist in some branch of the military after high school, which is a higher rate than the general population. (page 10)
 - d. Conclusion
 - i. JROTC programs have been evaluated in numerous studies and have been shown to have positive results, especially with at-risk, minority students in urban high schools. (page 11)
 - ii. Research has documented that JROTC programs are effective using various measures such as academic achievement, attendance, leadership scores and maturity scores. (page 12)
 - e. Discussion
 - i. The JROTC programs in schools continually emphasize discipline and responsibility; and provide a structured program which encourages students to strengthen these traits. The results were consistent with Rine and Warbles (1996) study. (page 18)
 - ii. ...there is not a difference between the academic performance of female and male AFJROTC cadets. (page 19)
 - iii. The results of Bulach’s survey (2002) indicated the behavior-based JROTC curriculum had a positive effect on students’ behavior associated with character traits. (page 21)
 - iv. The research study also determined whether the cadets’ character traits scores improved by taking multiple semester of JROTC. The ANOVA results indicated that there was no significant difference in the character traits scores of cadets



who completed one semester of AJFROTC, two to three semesters of AJFROTC, and four or more semesters of AJFROTC. (page 22-23)

2. Pema, Elda and Mehay, Stephen. Naval Postgraduate School; Graduate School of Business and Public Policy. "The Effect of High School JROTC on Student Achievement, Educational Attainment and Enlistment." 2008.
 - a. Applying a two stage matching technique, we find that JROTC participants have poorer academic outcomes than other students, although a large portion of these differences is explained by their at-risk status. In addition, program effects appear to differ by demographic group with black participants having lower dropout rates than white participants. The program also appears to improve self-esteem scores of females. Although the majority of JROTC participants do not join the military, we find large marginal enlistment effects. (page 2)
 - b. Nearly 40% of the high schools that offer JROTC are located in inner-city areas and about one-half of enrollees are minorities. Another indicator of program diversity is that about 40% of enrollees are females. In addition, the program accepts many students who could not qualify for military enlistment. These enrollment patterns in part explain why most students who ever participate in JROTC do not enter the military (about 70% in our data). (page 3)
 - c. To date no analysis has attempted to assess the wider effects of the program using nationally representative data. (page 4)
 - d. Overall, we find mixed program effects on educational outcomes. While JROTC participants in general have poorer academic performance, the program appears to reduce dropout rates and improve graduation rates for black participants and self-esteem scores for female participants. We also find strong enlistment effects across all participants. (page 4)
 - e. Other analyses of the regular JROTC program have consisted primarily of case studies. One such study compared student outcomes in El Paso and Chicago inner-city schools. (page 7)
 - f. The HSB and NELS surveys are the only data sets that provide national-level participation rates for JROTC. (page 7)
 - g. Although JROTC students appear more at-risk in their observable characteristics (suggesting a negative bias), they may be more motivated than the average at-risk student by virtue of their enrolling in a program that aims to improve career outcomes (suggesting an upward bias). (page 10)
 - h. One of the most salient differences is that black JROTC members have lower dropout rates than white participants (by 9-24 percentage points) and higher graduation rates (by 11-17 percentage points). Interestingly, the enlistment probability is similar across race groups. (page 17)
 - i. Does JROTC improve educational outcomes of minorities? NELS data indicate that among blacks, JROTC enrollees are less likely to drop out, more likely to graduate, and more likely to enlist. These positive program effects may be understated if black JROTC students are more at-risk than black non-participants, which is supported by a higher incidence of disciplinary problems for black JROTC students. When controlling for base-year disciplinary problems, however, their disciplinary issues in 12 grade are no different from other students. (page 17)
 - j. However, HSB data indicate that female participants have high self-esteem scores than both their male counterparts and female non-participants. Although compared to male



participants JROTC females are less likely to enlist, they are more likely to enlist than non-participant females. (page 18)

- k. Conclusion
 - i. Baseline estimates suggest that JROTC students have higher enlistment rates and lower post-secondary enrollment rates than their peers. (page 23)
 - ii. Black JROTC students (about one-third of all participants) have lower dropout rates and higher graduation rates than both white JROTC participants and black non-participants. In addition, females in JROTC (about 40% of participants) display higher self-esteem scores than both female non-participants and male enrollees. (page 23)
 - iii. It is important to note that this study estimates treatment effects for average JROTC students in average JROTC schools. (page 24)
3. Bulach, Cletus R. "Comparison of Character Traits for JROTC Students versus Non-JROTC Students." *Education* Vol. 122. No. 3. Spring 2002.
 - a. The behavior of 277 JROTC students on selected character traits was compared to the behavior of 200 non-JROTC students. The behavior of JROTC students was more positive on all 16 character traits measured by the survey. (page 559)
 - b. An instrument or survey has been developed that consists of 96 items associated with the following 16 character traits: respect for self, others and property, honesty, self control/disciplines, integrity/fairness, kindness, responsibility/dependability/accountability, perseverance/diligence/motivation, cooperation, compassion/empathy, courtesy/politeness, forgiveness, patriotism/citizenship, tolerance of diversity, humility, generosity/charity, and sportsmanship. Students respond to each of the items based on how they see or hear students performing on these behaviors. (page 560)
 - c. Permission was granted to see if students who were enrolled in their high school JROTC program differ significantly on behaviors associated with 16 character traits when compared to students who were not enrolled in JROTC program. (page 561)
 - d. The survey was administered to 277 JROTC students in grades 9-12 and to 200 students who were not in JROTC. The location was a high school in the Atlanta City School District in Atlanta, Georgia. The students were predominately Afro-American with about 5% of the population being other races. (page 561)
 - e. JROTC students tended to agree with positive behaviors and disagree with negative behaviors while the non-JROTC students' responses tended to disagree with positive behaviors and agree with negative behaviors. (page 561)
4. Elliott, Marc N., Hanser, Lawrence M., Gilroy, Curtis L. "Evidence of Positive Student Outcomes in JROTC Career Academies." National Defense Research Institute. 2000.
 - a. This research examines student outcomes for 18 cohorts of entering students enrolled in a total of eight pairs of schools in five major urban school districts across the United States. Pairs of schools were chosen to help rule out selectivity bias. We focus on student attendance, grades, and graduation status, using a propensity weighting technique to adjust for selection into the career academy. (page vii)
 - b. The cohorts consisted of ninth-grade students; in one pair the cohort consisted of tenth-grade students. The cohorts contained a total of 27,490 students. Students in the JROTCCA program were more likely to have taken standardized tests, but were also more likely to have had poor previous academic performance, both in the classroom and on standardized tests. (page vii)



- c. Grade-point averages (GPAs) for the JROTCCA students were significantly higher following enrollment in the program than would have been expected if they had been enrolled in the general academic program in six of ten cases. Also, absenteeism for the JROTCCA students was significantly lower than what would have been expected for these same students in the general academic program in seven of ten cases. (page vii)
 - d. In the two cases for which four-year graduation information was available, nearly twice as many of the students enrolled in the JROTCCA program in the ninth grade graduated as would have been expected to graduate had they been in the general academic program. In many cases, GPA and absenteeism in the JROTCCA program were also significantly better than what would have been expected in the standard JROTC program, as well. (page viii)
 - e. The major factor that students in focus groups mentioned was the nurturing environment the academy afforded them, and not the future job prospects that they envisioned as a result of the career focus of the academy. (page 18)
5. Perez, Gina. "Discipline and Citizenship: Latina/o Youth in Chicago JROTC Programs." In *New Landscapes of Inequality*, edited by Micaela di Leonardo, Jane Collins, and Brett Williams. Santa Fe, NM: School of American Research Press, 2008.
- a. Studied how the impact of JROTC extends beyond the classroom and beyond the lives of the young people who participate in and benefit from the program. Study focused on Chicago Public Schools, which in 2006 was the largest JROTC program in the nation.
 - b. The researcher spent three days observing and interviewing students participating in on Chicago public high school JROTC program. 19 students were interviewed, 10 Latina, 8 Latino and 1 African-American woman. 8 were born in Mexico.
 - c. In Chicago, working class Latina/o youth turned to JROTC for a variety of reasons, not the least of which was the strength of the program's extracurricular opportunities. Being able to travel to different places, meet new people, and engage in activities that commanded some respect were important reasons why students were interested in participating in JROTC. Moreover, students talked about how cultivating leadership skills and learning discipline also made the program attractive because these were lessons they would take with them to future jobs and college, lessons that would help them to be successful in those new contexts. Finally, student concerns about respect, especially while wearing the cadet uniform, were remarkable and spoke to the different ways they sought to be recognized, included, and given access to the privileges that often eluded them.

